

1 **Impact of scaling up Xpert MTB/RIF testing on the detection of Rifampicin resistant TB**  
2 **cases in Karachi, Pakistan**

3 **Authors:**

4 Wardah Mushtaq Awan, Community Health Solutions

5 Syed Mohammad Asad Zaidi, Community Health Solutions

6 Shifa Salman Habib, Community Health Solutions

7 Saira Khowaja, Interactive Research & Development

8 Aryn Malik, Interactive Research & Development

9 Uzma Khan, Interactive Research & Development

10 Rashida Ferrand, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine

11 Jacob Creswell, Stop TB Partnership

12 Aamir Khan, Interactive Research & Development

13 **Running Head:** Xpert MTB/RIF scale-up in Pakistan

14 **Word count of the summary:** 212 words

15 **Word count of text:** 2,783

16 **References:** 27

17 **Figures:** 4

18 **Key words:** Rifampicin resistance, second-line treatment, private sector

19 **Corresponding Author:** Shifa Salman Habib, MBBS, MSc.

20 Community Health Solutions

21 9<sup>th</sup> Floor, Al-Tijarah Building, Main Shahrah-e-Faisal, Karachi, Pakistan

22 [shifa.habib@chshealthcare.org](mailto:shifa.habib@chshealthcare.org)

23

24 **Abstract:**

25 **Setting:** Pakistan ranks fourth among high multi-drug resistance tuberculosis burden countries  
26 with only 19.2% of the 15,000 estimated incident cases being notified. Increasing treatment  
27 coverage for multi-drug resistance tuberculosis is a key priority for National Tuberculosis  
28 Program in Pakistan. World Health Organization recommends the use of Xpert MTB/RIF®  
29 assay as the first-line diagnostic test for individuals with presumed tuberculosis.

30 **Objective:** To describe a multi-faceted case-finding intervention targeting the public and private  
31 sectors that utilized Xpert MTB/RIF as a frontline diagnostic test for individuals with  
32 presumptive tuberculosis, in Karachi, Pakistan, and its impact on case-notifications of multi-drug  
33 resistance tuberculosis.

34 **Design:** Cross sectional study

35 **Results:** A total of 51,168 were tested on Xpert MTB/RIF®, of which 7,581 and 1,534 people  
36 were diagnosed with TB in the public sector (Reverse-Public private mix) and private sector  
37 (Social business model) arms, respectively, 574 (6.3% of all TB cases) were identified with  
38 Rifampicin resistance. A total of 517 (90.1%) people with rifampicin resistant tuberculosis,  
39 identified through the project were initiated on second-line treatment. The intervention resulted  
40 in 194 additional cases of rifampicin resistant tuberculosis, an increase of 43% over the baseline.

41 **Conclusion:** This project, one of the largest Xpert MTB/RIF® testing programs conducted at a  
42 city level, resulted in significantly increased detection and treatment of multi-drug resistance  
43 tuberculosis.

44

45

46

47

48 **Introduction:**

49 Multi-drug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) represents a significant threat to the ambitious  
50 global targets for ending TB [1,2]. In 2016, out of the estimated 490,000 people developing  
51 MDR-TB, only 153,119 (31.2%) were diagnosed and 129,689 (26.4%) were enrolled on second  
52 line treatment, and reported (Global report 2017) [2]. For many years, inadequate diagnostic  
53 capacity, particularly the limited availability of sensitive rapid diagnostic tests has been a key  
54 constraint [3]. The World Health Organization (WHO) currently recommends the use of Xpert  
55 MTB/RIF®(Xpert) assay as the first-line diagnostic test for individuals with presumed TB  
56 [Meeting Report 4]. While South Africa witnessed large increases in the numbers of people  
57 detected with drug resistance by using Xpert as the initial diagnostic test [5], many countries  
58 have used restrictive algorithms primarily due to high costs, relative to conventional smear  
59 microscopy [6] where limiting testing to previously treated patients and those with other risk  
60 factors misses out on MDR-TB among the large numbers of incident TB cases [7].  
61 Pakistan has the fourth highest burden of MDR-TB globally [2]. Increasing treatment coverage  
62 for MDR-TB forms an integral part of the National Strategic Plan for TB in Pakistan [8].  
63 However, of an estimated of 15,000 incident MDR-TB cases, only 2,881 (19.2%)(country  
64 profile) were enrolled for treatment in 2016, highlighting a significant treatment coverage gap  
65 [2]. Up to 90% of the MDR-TB burden is among people without known history of previous anti-  
66 TB treatment and are not currently covered through routine drug susceptibility testing (DST) [3].  
67 While the absolute number of MDR-TB cases is high, the prevalence of MDR-TB among both  
68 new (4.2%) and retreatment cases (16%) in Pakistan is low, relative to other high MDR-TB  
69 burden countries in Eastern Europe and Central Asia [2].(Pakistan's only drug resistance survey  
70 was conducted in 2012-2013). To find additional cases of MDR-TB, testing on a large pool of  
71 people is required which may be resource intensive [9]. Additionally, in Pakistan, three-quarters

72 of the population accesses healthcare through the private-sector [10]. However, the Public  
73 Private Mix (PPM) contribution to TB case notification was 28% in 2016 , (global report 2017),  
74 previous efforts to form linkages with private-providers for drug-susceptible TB have not  
75 focused on detection of MDR-TB. Xpert testing in the private sector without donor or  
76 government subsidies is prohibitively expensive for most patients [11].  
77 The Xpert assay was introduced in Pakistan in 2011[3]. However, further experience in scaled  
78 implementation of Xpert testing is required to inform its utilization across the different levels of  
79 the health system. This study describes a multi-faceted case-finding intervention targetting the  
80 public and private sectors that utilized Xpert as a frontline diagnostic test in Karachi, Pakistan,  
81 and its impact on case-notifications of drug resistant tuberculosis (DR-TB). We aim to fill the  
82 gaps in published literature on potential constraints in implementation of Xpert testing in high  
83 MDR burden, programmatic settings.

84

#### 85 **Study Population and Methods:**

##### 86 *Study setting*

87 Karachi is the country's largest city and economic hub, with a population estimated of 23 million  
88 [12] with over 60% of the population residing in high-density slums [10]. Approximately 15  
89 private-sector facilities are registered as Basic Management Units (BMUs) with the NTP where  
90 TB diagnostic and treatment services are available. A total of 3 programmatic management for  
91 drug-resistant TB (PMDT) sites (two in the public-sector, one private-sector), are present in the  
92 city where patients can receive MDR-TB treatment, offered free-of-cost.

##### 93 *Project Interventions*

94 This project was part of the *TBXpert Project* that aimed to increase case-notification for TB  
95 through scale-up of Xpert testing. The intervention in Karachi consisted of two distinct arms: 1)  
96 a Reverse - Public Private Mix (R-PPM) arm, targeting public-sector hospitals and Programmatic  
97 Management of Drug Resistant Tuberculosis (PMDT) sites; and 2) a Social Business Model  
98 (SBM) targeting the private-sector. A new case was defined as not having been treated for TB  
99 previously.

100

101 Reverse Public-Private Mix (R-PPM) Model:

102 Under this approach, TB diagnostics and treatment capacity was strengthened at existing public-sector  
103 facilities. Xpert machines were installed at the TB laboratories of 6 public-sector hospitals and 1  
104 private-sector PMDT site. The hospitals were provided additional staff including an Xpert technician  
105 and health workers who screened individuals in waiting areas of outpatient clinics and other wards  
106 of the hospitals for TB symptoms, as per the WHO symptom screen (ref) including cough of any  
107 duration, fever, hemoptysis, night-sweats and unexplained weight-loss. The health workers also  
108 supported the TB clinic through collection of sputum samples from other wards, assisting patients in  
109 sputum expectoration, data collection, registering and counseling of people with TB. Sputum was  
110 collected for Xpert testing from all presumptives who were able to expectorate sputum and gave  
111 consent for the test. The intervention sites were set targets for TB case-identification and  
112 compensation for staff was performance-based, with incentives provided for TB case-identification  
113 and ensuring high treatment initiation rates. Supervisory visits by managers were carried out to ensure  
114 maintenance of equipment, quality assurance of data, trouble-shooting and ensuring supply-chain of  
115 Xpert cartridges was appropriately maintained.

116

117 Social Business Model (SBM)

118 TB testing was carried out at three purpose-built TB centers called “*Sehatmand Zindagi*”

119 (Healthy Life). This model utilized community-based screeners, placed at 180 private health

120 providers’ clinics (including both formal and informal) in the vicinity of the TB centers where

121 they carried out verbal symptomatic screening (as per the WHO symptom screen) of patients and

122 referred them for testing that is a Chest X-ray (US\$3-5) and free-of-cost Xpert at the centers after

123 a positive symptom screen and clinical evaluation by the health providers. Those individuals who

124 could not pay for the chest Xray, were cascaded directly to Xpert while those who were unable to

125 expectorate sputum for testing were further evaluated by a clinical officer based on clinical

126 symptoms and chest Xray findings. The SBM intervention evolved towards developing a

127 medical detailing team, that engaged a network of approximately 600 private-providers and

128 encouraged referrals for TB testing. People identified with drug-susceptible TB in the SBM

129 intervention were provided free treatment from the centers, registered as BMUs with the

130 Provincial Tuberculosis Program (PTP). People at R-PPM sites were registered for treatment at

131 the testing site or at the facility of referral. Individuals identified with rifampicin resistance(Rif-

132 resistance) were referred to the one of the three PMDT sites in the city and initiated on second-

133 line drugs, after repeat Xpert testing. Sputum samples were also obtained for culture from all

134 patients registered for treatment for confirmation of Rif resistance.

135

136 *Data Analysis:*

137 The study utilized de-identified data collected for patient screening and testing indicators including

138 Xpert log files and summary of laboratory reports from each intervention site, for a total time-

139 period of 8 quarters of the intervention from Q3-2013 – Q2 2015. Aggregate summary reports for

140 quarterly patient enrollment and treatment initiation at PMDT sites was obtained to identify the  
141 total number of Rif resistant TB cases registered in Karachi.  
142 Summary statistics describing Xpert testing and *Mycobacterium TB* (MTB) yield at each  
143 intervention site and intervention (SBM and R-PPM) were determined. The TB REACH  
144 methodology for additionality calculations was adapted for DR-TB notifications [13]. This  
145 approach allows for a more accurate estimation of impact directly attributable to project activities.  
146 Briefly, the methodology involves determining the quarterly historical case-notifications in the  
147 intervention area of the previous 12 quarters prior to the start of the activities. A regression line is  
148 fitted to the historical notifications and extrapolated to forecast notifications that would have taken  
149 place in the absence of any intervention. These are compared with the number of actual  
150 notifications that took place during the intervention period to determine the overall additionality  
151 of cases. In order to control any bias resulting from the setup of new PMDT sites outside of  
152 Karachi, cases were known to have residential addresses outside of the city, were excluded from  
153 the analysis. All data analysis was carried out on Microsoft Excel.

154

#### 155 *Ethical Approval:*

156 This study was approved by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) at Interactive Research and  
157 Development (IRD). The IRB is registered with the U.S. Department of Health and Human  
158 Services (DHHS), Office for Human Research Protections (IRB#00005148).

159 Verbal consent was obtained from participants before conducting Xpert tests.

160

#### 161 **Results:**

162 *TB Screening and Xpert MTB/RIF testing:*

163 Between July 2013 and June 2015, 115,360 people with presumptive TB were identified, 80.4%  
164 through the R-PPM intervention and 19.6% through the SBM (Figure 1). Of these 39 301 clients  
165 at the R-PPM sites and 11 867 clients at the SBM sites had Xpert tests performed (Figure 1). A  
166 total of 9,115 MTB+ cases were detected through the two interventions; 7,581 (83.2%) and 1 534  
167 (16.8%) MTB+ cases were identified in the R-PPM and SBM arms, respectively. Yield of  
168 bacteriologically positive cases was 19.3% at R-PPM sites and 12.9% at the SBM sites. Table 1  
169 shows the difference in Xpert testing, cases detected and started on treatment, between the two  
170 intervention arms.

171

#### 172 *DR-TB treatment coverage:*

173 Of all MTB+ individuals, 8,541(93.7%) were drug susceptible, of whom 7,576 started on first  
174 line treatment (88.7% of the total). Among those with a MTB+ result, 574 (6.3%), were also  
175 identified with Rif-resistance (Rif+/DR-TB), of whom 524 (91.3%) were detected at the R-PPM  
176 sites and 50 (8.7%) at the SBM sites. The yield of Rif-resistance was 6.9% and 3.3% for R-PPM  
177 and SBM interventions, respectively (Figure 1). Within the Rif+ (presumed and confirmed Rif-  
178 resistance) identified through the project, a total of 517 were initiated on second-line treatment  
179 (90.1% of the total yield). A total of 46 (8.5%) individuals were pre-treatment loss to follow-up,  
180 whereas 11 (2.1%) deaths were recorded.

181

#### 182 *Impact on notified DR-TB cases in the intervention population (Karachi district)*

183 At the Karachi district level, a total of 642 DR-TB cases were detected during the intervention  
184 period of which 149 were new diagnoses. This constituted a 43% increase in identification of DR-  
185 TB cases over the baseline trend (Figure 2). The proportion of newly diagnosed cases among all



186 reported DR-TB cases increased from 7% in Q2 2013 to 22% in Q2 2015 during the intervention  
187 period (Figure 3)

188

189 **Discussion:**

190 This is the first study to investigate the impact of scaling Xpert implementation on additional DR-  
191 TB case-notifications from a programmatic setting in Pakistan. Our intervention targeted both the  
192 public, and the private sector through an innovative social business approach, distinguishing it  
193 from other studies reported from high MDR-TB burden countries.

194 An increase in number of DR-TB cases notifications in Karachi was observed relative to the years  
195 prior to the intervention. This study therefore supports existing evidence from other programmatic  
196 settings that have reported up to eight-fold increase in Rif resistant-TB case-detection through  
197 upfront Xpert testing [14-18]. Xpert testing has increased access to DST in countries such as South  
198 Africa, where up to 65% of new cases and 71% of previously treated cases have been tested for  
199 Rif-resistance [2], exceeding previous prevalence estimates for the disease in the country [2].

200 This study provides a number of lessons that can inform scale-up of Xpert in Pakistan and  
201 elsewhere. Our study highlights the significance of employing both, active case finding approaches  
202 and expanded diagnostic algorithms for Xpert testing to bridge the case-detection gap for DR-TB.  
203 Since new cases comprise up to 97% of the total TB cases notified, the burden of DR-TB is  
204 overwhelmingly within this group that does not receive routine access to DST [2]. In our study,  
205 the proportion of newly diagnosed cases among DR-TB cases increased from 7% at baseline to  
206 22%. However, the estimates for MDR-TB among new cases are much higher, and further scale-  
207 up of Xpert testing is expected to achieve greater yields.

208 Operationally, treatment initiation of patients diagnosed with Rif-resistance may be challenging  
209 [19-21]. Figure 4 summarizes factors that have contributed to low enrollment of patients in MDR-  
210 TB treatment program in Pakistan. The additional human resource provided at the TB centers in  
211 the private and public-sector hospitals that worked to support linkages to PMDT sites,  
212 complimented by close collaboration with PTP, resulted in a high proportion Rif-resistance cases  
213 to be initiated on treatment, with only 8.5% pre-treatment loss to follow-up in the project. It is  
214 important that future scale-ups invest in data systems, human resource training and strengthening  
215 linkages to DR-TB treatment sites, to ensure treatment initiation and better outcomes for  
216 individuals with DR-TB.

217 The R-PPM intervention involved fewer human and infrastructural investments in comparison to  
218 the private-sector intervention. The public sector sites carrying out the project interventions were  
219 high volume tertiary care hospitals, providing a large population base to screen from. Four-fifths  
220 of all Xpert tests were carried out through the R-PPM intervention. A higher MTB+ rate (MTB+ve  
221 out of all those tested) of 19.3% was also observed compared to SBM (12.9%) and it detected over  
222 90% of all Rif-resistant cases in the project. We hypothesize that sicker individuals are found at  
223 tertiary care hospitals compared to GP clinics leading to higher MTB+ and Rif+ yields at these  
224 sites. Our experience, therefore, supports targeted approaches such as R-PPM that leverage  
225 existing infrastructure and carryout structural enhancements and process improvements to increase  
226 access to DST. The private-sector intervention utilized a novel approach to PPM by establishment  
227 of new health centers and a referral network of private-providers through a sustainable social  
228 business model. While the SBM approach only detected 16.8% of all MTB+ cases and 50 Rif-  
229 resistant in the project cases, the number of referrals and Rif-resistant cases identified in the private  
230 sector increased over the course of the project and were less likely to be detected in the public

231 sector. Comparable trends are experienced in the establishment of any new business, where  
232 generating “foot-fall” often takes significant time before reaching maturity [22]. Similar strategies  
233 may be considered in countries with a rampant private health sector, particularly in South-Asia  
234 and Africa. While about three-quarters of all health services are availed in the private sector in  
235 Pakistan [10,11], only 28% of all TB cases were notified through private facilities [2]. During the  
236 study period the PPM contribution to TB case notifications was 15-20% in Pakistan and varied  
237 between 13-17% in India and about 55% in China (global report 2017). Increased engagement  
238 with the private-sector is therefore necessary despite lower yields and higher costs to identify  
239 additional cases that would likely have otherwise remained undiagnosed [1,2].

240 The potential options for diagnostic algorithms and case finding strategies need to be carefully  
241 appraised and measured against cost implications for each setting. Of the 48 high burden countries,  
242 at least 15 have adopted national guidelines based on testing of all presumptive TB cases on Xpert  
243 [2]. This may not be feasible in resource-constrained settings, including for countries with donor  
244 support for TB programs. However, testing algorithms focused on drug resistance presumptives  
245 only, may limit case-detection as a significant number of MDR-TB cases are among new TB cases.  
246 Pakistan’s first national anti-tuberculosis drug resistance survey reported Rif-resistance in 4.4%  
247 (95% CI: 2.4–4.9) of new cases [23]. Application of novel screening tools such as digital chest x-  
248 rays with computer-aided detection (CAD) has the potential to save Xpert cartridges and  
249 consequentially save costs [24, 25].

250 In our study, Xpert testing could only be performed on less than half of people identified as needing  
251 testing. Support was provided for expectoration through nebulizers and mucolytic agents, incurred  
252 additional costs and patient counseling efforts. Similar challenges may be encountered in other  
253 active case finding programs. Our experience with technical issues and equipment malfunctions is

254 consistent with those reported by early Xpert implementers elsewhere [11,26-27]. The costs of  
255 equipment maintenance, biomedical support, module re-calibrations and backup power supplies  
256 need to be incorporated within program budgets. Ensuring appropriate supply chains of cartridges  
257 and transport of patient sputum samples to Xpert testing sites are also probable challenges for  
258 large-scale implementers.

259 An important limitation of the study was that we were unable to determine as to what fraction of  
260 the additionality in DR-TB cases is attributable to the implementation of Xpert testing relative to  
261 the active case finding efforts in the project. As laboratory-level data was unavailable, it was not  
262 possible to ascertain the additional increase in testing for Xpert through active case-finding or to  
263 analyze the differences in yield of Rif-resistance in new versus retreatment cases. The study was  
264 conducted in a major urban center and may not be generalizable to rural settings where yield may  
265 be lower due to lower patient volumes and underdeveloped laboratory facilities.

266

267 **Conclusion:**

268 This study describes a multi-faceted scale-up of Xpert testing in public and private sectors in  
269 Karachi, Pakistan. An increase in the case-notifications for DR-TB were observed, relative to the  
270 historical trends supporting existing evidence from other programmatic settings in high DR-TB  
271 burden countries. A high proportion of those identified with Rif-resistance were initiated on  
272 second line treatment under the project. Further scale up of Xpert testing needs to take into  
273 account the most appropriate diagnostic algorithms weighed against cost implications, and  
274 ensure appropriate technical and operational support for effective program delivery.

275

276 **Acknowledgements:** The authors would like to acknowledge the contributions by the following  
277 people in carrying out the project interventions

278 Dr Rizvi, Jinnah Post Graduate Medical Center, Karachi,

279 Dr Mateen, Sindh Government Hospital, North Karachi

280 Dr Shakil, Sindh Government Hospital, Korangi, Karachi

281 Dr Zahid, Civil Hospital Karachi,

282 Dr Salman, Indus Hospital, Karachi

283 Dr Domki, Provincial Tuberculosis Program

284 Dr Ismat Ara, Provincial Tuberculosis Program

285 Dr Bhutto, Provincial Tuberculosis Program

286 Dr Huzoor, Provincial Tuberculosis Program

287 Dr Amanullah, Provincial Tuberculosis Program

288

289 **Funding:** This study was supported by the Stop TB Partnership's TB REACH initiative and was  
290 funded by the Government of Canada and UNITAID.

291

292 **Authors contributions:** WA, SMAZ and SK were involved in conception of the study and  
293 finalizing the study design. WA, AM and UK were involved in conducting data collection. SSH  
294 and SMAZ were involved in conducting the literature review, data analysis, data interpretation  
295 and drafting the manuscript. RF, JC and AK reviewed the drafts critically and finalized the  
296 manuscript. All authors reviewed and approved the final version to be published.

297

298 **Conflict of Interest:** The authors declare they have no competing interests.

299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320

References:

1. Stop TB Partnership. Global Plan to End TB: The Paradigm Shift 2016-2020
2. World Health Organization. Global tuberculosis report 2017.
3. Creswell J, Codlin AJ, Andre E, Micek MA, Bedru A, Carter EJ, Yadav RP, Mosneaga A, Rai B, Banu S, Brouwer M. Results from early programmatic implementation of Xpert MTB/RIF testing in nine countries. *BMC infectious diseases*. 2014 Jan 2;14(1):2.
4. Mbonze NB, Tabala M, Wenzel LK, Bakoko B, Brouwer M, Creswell J, Van Rie A, Behets F, Yotebieng M. Xpert® MTB/RIF for smear-negative presumptive TB: impact on case notification in DR Congo. *The International Journal of Tuberculosis and Lung Disease*. 2016 Feb 1;20(2):240-6.
5. World Health Organization. Global tuberculosis report 2012

- 321 6. Qin ZZ, Pai M, Van Gemert W, Sahu S, Ghiasi M, Creswell J. How is Xpert MTB/RIF  
322 being implemented in 22 high tuberculosis burden countries?. *European Respiratory*  
323 *Journal*. 2015 Feb 1;45(2):549-54.
- 324 7. Falzon D, Jaramillo E, Wares F, Zignol M, Floyd K, Raviglione MC. Universal access to  
325 care for multidrug-resistant tuberculosis: an analysis of surveillance data. *The Lancet*  
326 *Infectious Diseases*. 2013 Aug 31;13(8):690-7.
- 327 8. National TB Control Program Pakistan. National TB Control Strategy Plan. Vision 2020.  
328 2014
- 329 9. World Health Organization. Gear up to end TB: introducing the end TB strategy. Geneva,  
330 Switzerland: World Health Organization. 2015
- 331 10. Nishtar S. Choked pipes: reforming Pakistan's mixed health system
- 332 11. Albert H, Nathavitharana RR, Isaacs C, Pai M, Denkinger CM, Boehme CC.  
333 Development, roll-out and impact of Xpert MTB/RIF for tuberculosis: what lessons have  
334 we learnt and how can we do better?. *European Respiratory Journal*. 2016 Jul 13;ERJ-  
335 00543.
- 336 12. World Population Review 2014, Retrieved March 20, 2017, from worldpopulationreview:  
337 [http://worldpopulationreview.c om/world-cities/karachi-population/](http://worldpopulationreview.com/world-cities/karachi-population/)
- 338 13. Creswell J, Sahu S, Blok L, Bakker MI, Stevens R, Ditiu L. A multi-site evaluation of  
339 innovative approaches to increase tuberculosis case notification: summary results. *PLoS*  
340 *One*. 2014 Apr 10;9(4):e94465.
- 341 14. Durovni B, Saraceni V, van den Hof S, et al. Impact of replacing smear microscopy with  
342 Xpert MTB/RIF for diagnosing tuberculosis in Brazil: a stepped-wedge cluster-  
343 randomized trial. *PLoS Med* 2014; 11: e1001766.

- 344 15. Raizada N, Sachdeva KS, Sreenivas A, et al. Catching the missing million: experiences in  
345 enhancing TB and DR-TB detection by providing upfront Xpert MTB/RIF testing for  
346 people living with HIV in India. PLoS One 2015; 10: e0116721.
- 347 16. Raizada N, Sachdeva KS, Nair SA, et al. Enhancing TB case detection: experience in  
348 offering upfront Xpert MTB/RIF testing to pediatric presumptive TB and DR TB cases  
349 for early rapid diagnosis of drug sensitive and drug resistant TB. PLoS One 2014; 9:  
350 e105346.
- 351 17. Sachdeva KS, Raizada N, Sreenivas A, et al. Use of Xpert MTB/RIF in decentralized  
352 public health settings and its effect on pulmonary TB and DR-TB case finding in India.  
353 PLoS One 2015; 10: e0126065.
- 354 18. Trajman A, Durovni B, Saraceni V, et al. Impact on patients' treatment outcomes of  
355 XpertMTB/RIF implementation for the diagnosis of tuberculosis: follow-up of a stepped-  
356 wedge randomized clinical trial. PLoS One 2015; 10: e0123252
- 357 19. Low M, Thom A. HIV positive: is South Africa winning? NSP Review 2013; 9: 1–45.
- 358 20. Cowan J, Michel C, Manhiça I, Monivo C, Saize D, Creswell J, Gloyd S, Micek M.  
359 Implementing rapid testing for tuberculosis in Mozambique. Bulletin of the World Health  
360 Organization. 2015 Feb;93(2):125-30.
- 361 21. Charambira K, Ade S, Harries AD, Ncube RT, Zishiri C, Sandy C, Mutunzi H, Takarinda  
362 K, Owiti P, Mafaune P, Chonzi P. Diagnosis and treatment of TB patients with rifampicin  
363 resistance detected using Xpert® MTB/RIF in Zimbabwe. Public health action. 2016 Jun  
364 21;6(2):122-8.
- 365 22. Bashar A. Factors affecting conversion of footfalls in retail stores. International Journal  
366 of Management and Strategy. 2012;3(4):199-202.



- 367 23. Tahseen S, Qadeer E, Khanzada FM, Rizvi AH, Dean A, Van Deun A, Zignol M. Use of  
368 Xpert® MTB/RIF assay in the first national anti-tuberculosis drug resistance survey in  
369 Pakistan. *The International Journal of Tuberculosis and Lung Disease*. 2016 Apr  
370 1;20(4):448-55.
- 371 24. Rahman MT, Codlin AJ, Rahman MM, Nahar A, Reja M, Islam T, Qin ZZ, Khan MA,  
372 Banu S, Creswell J. An evaluation of automated chest radiography reading software for  
373 tuberculosis screening among public-and private-sector patients. *European Respiratory*  
374 *Journal*. 2017 May 1;49(5):1602159.
- 375 25. Muyoyeta M, Maduskar P, Moyo M, Kasese N, Milimo D, Spooner R, Kapata N,  
376 Hogeweg L, van Ginneken B, Ayles H. The sensitivity and specificity of using a  
377 computer aided diagnosis program for automatically scoring chest X-rays of presumptive  
378 TB patients compared with Xpert MTB/RIF in Lusaka Zambia. *PloS one*. 2014 Apr  
379 4;9(4):e93757.
- 380 26. Durovni B, Saraceni V, Cordeiro-Santos M, Cavalcante S, Soares E, Lourenço C,  
381 Menezes A, van den Hof S, Cobelens F, Trajman A. Operational lessons drawn from  
382 pilot implementation of Xpert MTB/Rif in Brazil. *Bulletin of the World Health*  
383 *Organization*. 2014 Aug;92(8):613-7.
- 384 27. Sikhondze W, Dlamini T, Khumalo D, Maphalala G, Dlamini S, Zikalala T, Albert H,  
385 Wambugu J, Tayler-Smith K, Ali E, Ade S. Countrywide roll-out of Xpert® MTB/RIF in  
386 Swaziland: the first three years of implementation. *Public health action*. 2015 Jun  
387 21;5(2):140-6.

388

389

390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412

Figures:

Figure 1: TB screening and Xpert MTB/RIF testing results

Overview of Xpert MTB/RIF testing and TB case detection as part of the TBXpert initiative, from July 2013 to June 2015, in Karachi, Pakistan

Figure 2: DR-TB case notifications (pre-and post-intervention)

DR-TB case notifications trend during intervention period and forecasted baseline trend (in the absence of any intervention), from July 2013 to June 2015, in Karachi, Pakistan

Figure 3: Proportion of newly diagnosed cases among all DR-TB cases

Proportion of newly diagnosed cases among all DR-TB cases, from July 2013 to June 2015, Karachi, Pakistan

413 7: Factors contributing to low enrollment of MDR-TB patients in treatment programs

414 Illustration of factors that have historically contributed to low enrollment of MDR-TB patients in

415 treatment programs in Pakistan

416

417

418

419

420

421

422

423

424